



**Village of Plainfield
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION (HPC)
Record of Minutes**

DATE: December 11, 2008

LOCATION: Village Hall

Chairman Lambert called the meeting to order at 7:04 p.m.

ROLL CALL

Present: Commissioners Bortel, Bright, Derrick, Hendricksen, Olsen, Spangler, and Wright; and Chairman Lambert

Absent:

Also present: Sara Javoronok-Planner I Village of Plainfield, Donna Ryan – Secretary Village of Plainfield

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA:

The agenda was approved as presented.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: November 13, 2008

Commissioner Bortel made a motion to approve the Minutes as presented. Commissioner Hendricksen seconded.

Chairman Lambert asked for a voice vote. All the commissioners said “aye” and the Minutes were approved as presented.

CHAIR’S COMMENTS:

Chairman Lambert thanked all of the Commissioners for their hard work, efforts, and dedication this last year. He also thanked Planner Javoronok for her hard work in making the job of the Commissioners much easier. He also wished everyone a very healthy holiday season and a happy new year.

FIVE MINUTE FIELD GUIDE:

Chairman Lambert stated this is a continuation of looking at architecturally designed buildings in Plainfield. John E. Minott of Aurora was credited with the earliest architecturally designed commercial building, and G. Julian Barnes was credited with the first architecturally designed residential building, which now stands on Illinois Street between Chicago and Ottawa Streets. The house stood at the southwest corner of Division and Ottawa Streets for the first 53 years after its construction. Chairman Lambert presented a history of Julian Barnes. Julian Barnes also designed two well known limestone commercial buildings in Joliet, the Auditorium Building in 1891 and the Stevens Building in 1895. He also designed the W. T. Scott house in 1981 in Dwight, Illinois, which he remodeled 4 years later for use as part of the Keeley Institute. His brother, John, designed the former City Hall in Lockport, Illinois, as well as many public schools in Joliet.

From historic records, it appears the Julian Barnes house was built for George and Rebecca Frey in 1885 or 1886. Chairman Lambert gave a history of the Frey family. The Julian Barnes house was designed in the Queen Anne Style. It was a stark departure from the bold, cubic forms of the Italianate homes which were being erected throughout the Village of Plainfield at that time. The Queen Anne and Stick style homes incorporated Eastlake influences and symbolized Julian Barnes’ revolutionary approach to residential design. The Queen Anne style was popularized as a residential style in America between 1880 and 1910. The Stick style was popular between 1860 and 1890. The Queen

Anne, like the Stick styles, utilized wall surfaces as the primary decorative elements of buildings. Flat walls were avoided by incorporating bays, towers, overhangs, and other wall projections. The wall surfaces were detailed with different textures whenever possible.

The Stick style was defined primarily by its heavy reliance on decorative detailing of wall surfaces. Residences designed in the Stick style exhibit “stick work” that faintly mimics exposed structural members, as well as framing wall areas of shingle and siding laid up in a variety of patterns, including herringbone patterns. Broad, one-story porches or encircling verandahs were popular in both styles. The use of a variety of window shapes, sizes, and patterns, including decorative glass, is more common in the Queen Anne style.

Chairman Lambert gave a history of the owners of the Julian Barnes’ built house (Frey-VanDyke-Selfridge-Domark-Emrath/Cardella). In 1939 it was moved from its Division Street location to its present location on Illinois. When the home was relocated, it was placed on a concrete block foundation and converted to apartments. The roofline of the home was altered to provide an additional apartment in the former attic. The original turret was integrated into the mid-1940’s roofline. In the mid 1970’s an encircling porch, which replicates the historic verandah, was constructed. It was constructed of steel components rather than wood. Many of the decorative glass windows were restored. Some new decorative glass windows and an attached garage to the rear of the house were added. The home was sold to the present owners, the Domark Family, in the early 1990’s.

Although altered from its original appearance and relocated from its intended prominent site along a major entry route into the Village, the 1886 Frey residence retains most of the original architectural character and detail as envisioned by Julian Barnes. Chairman Lambert concluded the Five Minute Field Guide.

One of the Commissioners asked the location of the home and also if this is the only home by Barnes in Plainfield. Chairman Lambert stated it is the only house that can be documented. A Commissioner also asked if it was the earliest architecturally designed house, and Chairman Lambert stated it was the earliest architecturally designed house that he has been able to locate so far. It was also asked if most of Julian Barnes’ work was primarily in Joliet. Chairman Lambert stated it was primarily in Joliet, although he did work in Morris and Cook County in Chicago. Chairman Lambert ended the Five Minute Field Guide.

COMMISSIONERS’ COMMENTS:

Commissioner Olsen inquired about the visit from Code Enforcement to the Commission. Planner Javoronok stated there was a meeting in early November. A couple of the Commissioners attended, along with Code Enforcement and the Building Department to discuss some of the issues, primarily property maintenance and things like that. Some information is being put together to bring back to the Commission, probably in the spring.

Commissioner Olsen asked who had attended the meeting from the Commission. Planner Javoronok stated it was Chairman Lambert, and Commissioner Wright. Chairman Lambert stated the purpose of the meeting was to have a meeting of minds in preparation to making a presentation to the Commission. Planner Javoronok stated it was kind of a pre-meeting before coming to the Commission. Chairman Lambert stated Code Enforcement wanted clarification about what the Commission was asking them to present.

Commissioner Wright stated he took some pictures of the Kendall County Jail. There was a discussion among the Commissioners regarding the Kendall County Jail. Planner Javoronok pointed out there are also some pictures on the IHPA website taken about 15 years ago that are in black and white.

PUBLIC COMMENT: (Items not on the Agenda)

None

STAFF REPORT

Planner Javoronok summarized the staff report.

One landmark application has been listed for 15005 S. Bartlett Avenue. No demolition applications have been received. There is one addition to the Preservation Watch List. It is 15916 S. Rt. 59. It is a residence that has Greek Revival influence. The Rural Survey noted it to be contributing. There are no new items for the Development Report. She stated a copy of the letter that was sent to Kendall County was included in the Commissioners' packets. Also, a copy from the Illinois Historic Preservation Agency regarding Plainfield's CLG status was included in the packet. At this point, the State of Illinois has forwarded the application on to the National Park Service for their review and decision.

Another sheet needing to be signed by the Mayor has been signed and sent back to the IHPA. Planner Javoronok concluded her staff report.

Commissioner Spangler thought the property on the Preservation Watch List, 15303 S. Rt. 59, had been removed from the list. Planner Javoronok stated it has remained on the Watch List. Commissioner Spangler thought it had been approved for demolition. Planner Javoronok stated the Commission has signed off on it, but it is still on the list at this point. Chairman Lambert thought the Commission had signed off for the proposal that was coming forward at that time. The developer had chosen not to demolish it. So, until a formal demolition permit is issued, it still is on the Watch List. Planner Javoronok stated there has been a demolition permit request approved for that property though.

One of the Commissioners asked if the house at 15916 S. Rt. 59 was somewhere else in the Village and then moved there, or has it always been at that location. Planner Javoronok believed it had always been at that location. Chairman Lambert stated the house was built at that location. The section to the south was built second and then the upright portion was built probably around 1844. Commissioner Bortel stated it is one of the older houses in town also. Chairman Lambert stated that was correct. Chairman Lambert was glad that this house was on the Watch List. Chairman Lambert stated there is some history on it.

One of the Commissioners asked if it could be confirmed that Mayor Waldorf did return the CLG application to the State. Planner Javoronok stated it was signed by the Mayor on December 8th and it was sent back to IHPA.

Chairman Lambert excused himself from the meeting because he had involvement in the following two cases. He turned the meeting over to Vice-Chairman Bortel. Commissioner Spangler also excused himself.

OLD BUSINESS:

CASE: 1426-091508.HPC

15326 S. (208 N.) JOLIET ROAD

Request: Landmark

Location: 15326 S. (208 N.) Joliet Road

Applicant: Craig Spangler

Vice-Chairman Bortel asked for a motion to open the public hearing for Case: 1426-091508.HPC.

At 7:26 p.m. Commissioner Bright made a motion to open the public hearing.

Commissioner Olsen seconded the motion.

Vice-Chairman Bortel called for a roll call vote.

Aye: Derrick, Hendirksen, Olsen, Wright, Bright, Vice-Chairman Bortel

Nay: 0

The motion carried.

Planner Javoronok summarized the staff report. She stated the applicant is requesting Landmark Designation. It is known as the Chittenden-Owens-Spangler House. It is located in the O.J. Corbin subdivision. The nomination is for the residence and not the non-contributing garage. The house is included in the Urban Core Survey as a contributing structure and is also recommended for local landmark status. It was noted to be a contributing structure for potential local historic districts and National Register historic districts. Planner Javoronok gave a history of the property. Staff is recommending landmark designation under criteria c, d, f, and j. She went through the criteria for designation. Planner Javoronok concluded her staff report.

Vice-Chairman Bortel asked the Commissioners if they wished to make any comments, or ask any questions of staff.

One of the Commissioners stated staff had mentioned 1914, which was before the stucco in her staff report. He asked if there was a photo before 1914. Planner Javoronok stated there was a photo from 1899, 1915, 1916, and 1918. As far as it being 1914 for the date, there was also a newspaper clipping included in the packet that went over the different renovations that Dr. Owens was making to the house in 1914. That is where that date came from. Planner Javoronok showed some slides with pictures of the structure from these different dates.

Commissioner Hendricksen asked if the stucco helped to protect the original materials underneath for the most part. Planner Javoronok stated she believed so to a certain degree, but did not know too much about that. By the time the owner had taken the stucco off, the stucco was starting to deteriorate, but not the materials underneath.

Commissioner Derrick felt there were integrity issues with criteria "f". Commissioner Olsen felt there still was enough original detail. There was a discussion among some of the Commissioners regarding the architectural elements. Planner Javoronok stated the arch dormer was added during the remodeling in 1914 and 1915 as per Page 4 of the nomination.

Commissioner Olsen asked what the implication would be to not include criteria "f". Planner Javoronok stated at least one of the criteria needs to be met, and preferably not just criteria "j".

Commissioner Derrick stated today there is the original clapboard siding, some of it has been reconstructed. There is the form of the wrap around verandah. There are pictures that guide a very good rehabilitation and restoration of those features. The form of the building is conveyed effectively. She felt there are integrity issues under criteria "f". She wondered if there was still enough stuff that the "f" criteria is still warranted. A discussion followed among the Commissioners regarding including criteria "f". Commissioner Derrick stated maybe criteria "f" should just be revised to reference that the clapboard is still there, the architectural form is still there, and whatever other elements that still exist of detailing, etc. (windows, doors).

Commissioner Derrick asked how this would impact later reviews. She wondered if the Commission would have the ability to preserve certain items that were not necessarily called out now. Planner Javoronok stated the details are called out in criteria "c" and to an extent in criteria "d". As far as the nomination, there is discussion about the architectural styles as well.

Vice-Chairman Bortel stated if someone would want to make changes to this they would have to come before the Commission once it is designated a landmark. Vice-Chairman Bortel asked if the Commission needed a picture of the property when all of the changes have been made to keep with all of the other previous pictures of the property. Planner Javoronok felt that would be included in the file as well. If a new owner would want to make changes they would need a building permit and would have to come before the Commission before making the changes.

Commissioner Bright asked if the data would be changed for criteria "f". Vice-Chairman Bortel stated staff has made the appropriate changes to the wording.

Commissioner Hendricksen was impressed with the application from the applicant.

Vice-Chairman Bortel asked for a motion to close the public hearing.

At 7:49 p.m. Commissioner Wright made a motion to close the public hearing for Case: 1426-091508.HPC.

Commissioner Hendricksen seconded the motion.

Vice-Chairman Bortel called for a voice vote. All the Commissioners were in favor of closing the public hearing.

There was no public comment.

At 7:51 p.m. Commissioner Derrick made a motion that the Historic Preservation Commission recommends approval of the Landmark Application for 15326 S. Joliet Road – Case No. 1426-092508.HPC. per criteria “c”, “d”, “f”, and “j”.

Commissioner Wright seconded the motion.

Vice-Chairman Bortel called for a vote by roll call.

Aye: Bright, Derrick, Hendricksen, Olsen, Wright, Vice-Chairman Bortel
Nay: 0

The motion is carried 6:0

NEW BUSINESS:

CASE: 1435-111708.HPC

15005 S. (719 N.) BARTLETT AVE.

Request: Landmark

Location: 15005 S. (719 N.) Bartlett Ave.

Applicant: Michael Lambert

Vice-Chairman Bortel asked for a motion to open the public hearing for Case: 1435-111708.HPC – 15005 S. (719 N.) Bartlett Ave.

7:51 p.m. Commissioner Derrick made a motion that the Historic Preservation Commission open the public hearing for Case: 1435-111708.HPC.

Commissioner Olsen seconded the motion.

Vice-Chairman Bortel called for a vote by roll call.

Aye: Hendricksen, Olsen, Wright, Bright, Derrick, Vice-Chairman Bortel
Nay: 0

The motion is carried 6:0

Planner Javoronok summarized the staff report. The applicant is requesting landmark designation. This property is owned by Mary Alice Lambert and is to be known as the Evarts-Eaton-Lambert House. The nomination is for the contributing residence and the garage. They were not recommended for either local or national landmark status per the 2006 Plainfield Historic Urbanized Core Survey primarily because of the alterations that occurred in the 1964 remodeling. The house presently is being restored to its 1888-1924 appearance. She showed photographs of the property. She gave a history of the property. The style is representative of the Queen Anne and Shingle styles. She summarized the criteria for nomination. Staff recommends nomination per criteria “c”, “d”, “f”, and “j”.

Vice-Chairman Bortel made a change to the staff report. Under Statement of Significance the staff report stated that staff recommends nomination of the Chittenden-Owens-Spangler House for designation and that should be changed to the Evarts-Eaton-Lambert House.

Vice-Chairman Bortel asked if the petitioner wished to make any comments. There was no response from the petitioner.

Commissioner Wright stated there was much talk about the garage, but a residence is also referenced in the packet. He asked if there were two structures in this nomination. Planner Javoronok stated there are two structures, a residence and a garage. Commissioner Wright asked if they were both included in the sample motion. Planner Javoronok stated the motion could be changed to incorporate that.

Commissioner Bright asked if there was a third floor. She noticed there were windows. It was determined that was an attic.

Commissioners Hendricksen and Olsen felt the applications and reports were well done. Vice-Chairman Bortel also agreed.

Vice-Chairman Bortel asked if there was any public comment. There was none.

Vice-Chairman Bortel asked for a motion to close the public hearing.

At 8:05 p.m. Commissioner Bright made a motion that the Commission close the public hearing for Case: 1435-111708.HPC – 15005 S. (719 N.) Bartlett Avenue.

Commissioner Olsen seconded the motion.

Vice-Chairman Bortel called for a voice vote. All Commissioners were in favor.

At 8:05 p.m. Commissioner Bright made a motion that the Historic Preservation Commission recommends approval of the landmark application for 15005 S. Bartlett Ave, which would include the garage per criteria “c”, “d”, “f”, and “j”.

Commissioner Wright seconded the motion.

Vice-Chairman Bortel called for a roll call vote.

Aye: Olsen, Wright, Bright, Derrick, Hendricksen, Vice-Chairman Bortel

Nay: 0

The motion is carried 6:0

Commissioner Spangler and Chairman Lambert returned to the meeting.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION BROCHURE

Planner Javoronok talked about the Historic Preservation Brochure which she included in the Commissioners' packets. The updated Historic Preservation Brochure was discussed last year. It includes new photographs, with some of the recent landmarks and properties in the District. It includes additional information on the Property Tax Assessment Freeze Program and Historic Preservation Tax Credits. The Village is getting close to obtaining a CLG status. She asked if there were any further comments.

Commissioner Hendricksen stated there were a couple of typos. Commissioner Wright had written comments that he would pass on to Planner Javoronok. Commissioner Bortel stated the brochure looks very professional.

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS GUIDE

Planner Javoronok went over the process and what a Certificate of Appropriateness involves. The guide would include the different steps that are involved. There are also definitions included. It includes the different guidelines involving the standards from the Secretary of Interior. The Village has 10 design guidelines that are included in the ordinance.

Commissioner Wright referred to Page 3. He said a lot of things on Page 3 sound ominous. He wanted to soften the language.

Chairman Lambert stated possibly it could be explained that some of these requirements are the same that are required for a building permit. He wanted it brought to the applicant's attention that the Historic Preservation Commission is not asking for anything more than the applicant would be required to provide to the Building Department. He wanted to compliment Planner Javoronok on the brochures. They are user-friendly.

He stated if the Commissioners had anything regarding typos, etc., they could pass them on to Planner Javoronok at the close of the meeting.

Planner Javoronok received a verbal okay from the Commission.

COMMITTEE REPORTS:

Commissioner Bortel stated the LDDC met on December 4th and they discussed the Lockport Street Historic Corridor District. They also discussed signs for the new East Side Historic District. They will meet again in January to work toward getting the Lockport Street Corridor off and running, talking to the owners of the businesses downtown in the spring.

Chairman Lambert asked when the two cases that had been previously discussed will be going forward to the Village Board. Planner Javoronok stated they will be going forward in January of '09, mostly likely on January 5th.

DISCUSSION:

Commissioner Hendricksen asked Planner Javoronok if there was any pricing for the signs for the East Side Historic District. Planner Javoronok stated there was no pricing at this time. She will check with Public Works. Commissioner Hendricksen wanted this pursued.

ADJOURN:

At 8:15 p.m. Commissioner Bortel made a motion to adjourn the meeting.

Commissioner Henricksen seconded the Motion.

Chairman Lambert asked for a voice vote. All the Commissioners were in favor.

Chairman Lambert adjourned the meeting at 8:15 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,
Carol Millan - Recording Secretary