



Village of Plainfield
Historic Preservation Commission
Record of Minutes

Date: December 16, 2010

Location: Village Hall

CALL TO ORDER, ROLL CALL, PLEDGE

Chairman Bortel called the meeting to order at 7:04 p.m. Roll call was taken; Commissioners Allen, Bright, Olsen, Feagans, Witt and Chairman Bortel were present. Commissioners Spangler and Derrick were absent. Michael Garrigan –Village Planner; Merrilee Trotz, Recording Secretary was also present.

Chairman Bortel led the pledge to the flag.

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Commissioner Bright moved to approve the Agenda. Seconded by Commissioner Allen. Voice vote: All in favor. 0 – opposed 2-absent. Motion carried 6-0

Village Clerk Michelle Gibas swore in Commissioner Anthony Witt.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

Commissioner Olsen made motion to approve the minutes from October 14, 2010 as presented. Commissioner Feagans seconded the motion. All in favor. 0 – opposed 2-absent. Motion carried 6-0

CHAIR'S COMMENTS:

Chairman Bortel stated he located the phone number of the owner of the property at 15307 S. Route 59. He plans to contact the owner and ask for a meeting.

Chairman Bortel stated in the newsletter from Landmarks Illinois there was a section for the Top Ten Endangered Historic Places in Illinois. He proposes to nominate the property at 15307 S. Route 59 for the top ten endangered historic place even though it has not been landmarked.

Chairman Bortel stated he came through the downtown tonight and the Christmas lights with the snow were very relaxing and quaint looking.

COMMISSIONERS COMMENTS:

Commissioner Olsen mentioned she had attended a Traditional Building Show at Navy Pier and picked up an order form for the T-shirt being offered by Landmarks Illinois if anyone was interested.

PUBLIC COMMENT: (Items not on the Agenda)

No one approached the microphone.

STAFF REPORT

Mr. Garrigan stated there have been no new applications for landmarks or districts; there have been no pre-application meetings; and there are no new demolition permits. The Weinhold property (the barn and buildings on the southwest side of 127th Street and Naperville Road) has been added to the preservation watch list.

Mr. Garrigan stated the LDDC committee met last week and discussed and established a general timeline for the proposed downtown district. We propose to have a meeting with the committee of the whole on January 24, 2011 to outline potential benefits of any Historic District and it is our hope that Catherine O'Connell from Illinois Historic Agency will be able to attend. We have tentatively scheduled two educational meetings prior to any public hearing. Currently no application has been filed for a downtown district.

NEW BUSINESS

Case No. 1528-110510.HPC

Hagar-Smiley Residence

Commissioner Bright made a motion to open the public hearing. Commissioner Olsen seconded the motion. Vote by roll call. Commissioner Allen, yes; Commissioner Olsen, yes; Commissioner Feagans, yes; Commissioner Witt, yes; Commissioner Bright, yes; Chairman Bortel, yes. 6 yes, 0 no. 2 absent. Motion carried.

Mr. Garrigan stated this is a public hearing being heard pursuant to applicable state statutes, due notice has been given, and published pursuant to village ordinances. The applicant, Dr. Moravec, is requesting a landmark designation for his property located at 23842 W. Main Street. This property has historically been known as the Hagar-Smiley residence. The property is currently being used as an orthodontist office, currently zoned commercial.

The house was constructed by Jonathan Hagar in approximately 1852. Mr. Hagar was born in Quebec in February of 1807 and moved to Middlebury, Vermont. Mr. Hagar then went to Cleveland, Ohio in 1830; then in 1834, Jonathan Hagar and his partner Samuel Sargent arrived in Plainfield and opened a general merchandise store. Mr. Hagar was one of the early merchants in Plainfield. The subject site was originally purchased by James Mathers, one of the co-founders of the Village of Plainfield. The house and sawmill was constructed by Mathers on the east side of the DuPage River. In 1843 Jonathan Hagar married Catharine Goodhue and Mr. Hagar later became the first Justice of the Peace for Plainfield. Mr. Hagar also served on the first Village Board in Plainfield in 1877. Jonathan Hagar died in 1879 where upon the property was inherited by his second wife, Adeline Hagar. When Adeline Hagar died the property was transferred to her grandson Charles E. Fraser. Mr. Fraser died in 1924 and the

Smiley family became the owners of the property until 1984. The property has only been owned by four families.

The period of significance is from the date of construction 1852 through the period that the Smiley family owned the property in 1984. The historic survey identified the property as a contributing structure and it qualifies for individual landmark status and as a local landmark status if it were within a district.

The HPC must find one finding of fact to have been met by the applicant. The first finding of fact is:

- a) Has character, interest, or value which is part of the development, heritage, or cultural character of the community, county, state or nation:

This house itself is significant as it represents one of the best examples of Gothic Revival in the Village along with Italianate and Tudor elements. The house has been beautifully restored by Dr. Moravec.

The second finding of fact is:

- c) Is identified with a person who significantly contributed to the development of the community, county, state or nation:

Mr. Hagar was one of the earliest merchants in the Village; the first Justice of the Peace in the Village and a founding member of the Congregational Church Sunday School.

- c) Embodies distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style valuable for the study of a period, type, method of construction, or use of indigenous materials:

This house was heavily influenced by the Gothic Revival style which is represented by the steeply pitched cross gable and highly detailed front facing the gable along with the drop-eared molding and diamond patterns on the attic sash and rail. Also there are elements of the Italianate Villa style incorporated into the design and these elements include the two over two even light sash, double-leaved doors and detailed pair of red brackets replacing the coped barge boards.

- j) Is suitable for preservation or restoration:

This house has already been fully restored. The renovation that was completed by Dr. Moravec constitutes an excellent example of how historical structures can be adaptively re-used for business purposes.

- l) Has yielded or is likely to yield information important to prehistory, history, or other areas of archaeological significance:

The age of this structure and the fact that it was constructed by one of the early merchants in the Village of Plainfield demonstrates an excellent example of the type of housing that was constructed by some of the early prominent settlers in the Village.

Staff believes the subject property qualifies for designation under the criteria as reflected above.

Chairman Bortel indicated that Michael Lambert assisted Dr. Moravec in the renovation of this house using the 1870 lithograph. If this house is approved for a Landmark it will be the first in Plainfield that has been adaptively re-used for business purposes.

Commissioner Olsen asked who had reviewed this house. Chairman Bortel indicated Illinois Historic Preservation Agency submitted the project before any rehabilitation restoration was done to make sure any work on the house would pass if they would want to landmark the property later on. IHPA will review plans if anyone wants to restore a building.

Discussion was held regarding National Register and whether this house might qualify. Chairman Bortel stated National Register looks at the interiors and therefore this house might not qualify.

Chairman Bortel asked for public comments. There were none. The petitioner was not present.

Commissioner Bright made a motion to close the public hearing. Commissioner Feagans seconded the motion. Vote by roll call. Commissioner Allen, yes; Commissioner Olsen, yes; Commissioner Feagans, yes; Commissioner Witt, yes; Commissioner Olsen, yes; Commissioner Bright, yes; Chairman Bortel, yes. 6 yes, 0 no. 2 absent. Motion carried.

Commissioner Olsen stated they have done a great job on the rehabilitation restoration and felt it deserves the landmark status.

Chairman Bortel indicated the property could be archaeological investigated because some pottery was found from the 1850 and 1860's when one of the additions were done.

Commissioner Bright made a motion that the Historic Preservation Commission recommend approval of 23842 W. Main Street as a historic landmark based on the criteria outlined in the staff report. Commissioner Feagans seconded the motion. Vote by roll call. Commissioner Allen, yes; Commissioner Olsen, yes; Commissioner Feagans, yes; Commissioner Witt, yes; Commissioner Bright, yes; Chairman Bortel, yes. 6 yes, 0 no. 2 absent. Motion carried.

OLD BUSINESS:

None

COMMITTEE REPORTS:

LDDC discussed a proposal of several owners of the downtown district to bring forth a historic district for Lockport Street. LDDC has set up two information meetings that will be held at Village Hall in the Community Rooms A & B on January 12th at 7:00 p.m. and also on February 3rd at 7:00 p.m. There will be notification in the local newspapers and on Channel 6 and the

Village website. Everyone that wants to attend is invited. On January 24th we plan to have a joint meeting with the Committee of the Whole to discuss the idea of having a district in the downtown. We hope to have Catherine O'Conner from the IHPA attend that meeting and some other people present to discuss the advantages of having a downtown district. He stated there are 14 property owners downtown that are interested in the district and it is the hope that these people will talk those who are not interested.

DISCUSSION:

ADJOURN:

Commissioner Olsen made a motion to adjourn. Commissioner Bright seconded the motion. Voice vote: All in favor. 0 - opposed. Motion carried

Meeting adjourned at 7:50 p. m.

Respectfully submitted,
Merrilee Trotz - Recording Secretary