



Village of Plainfield  
Historic Preservation Commission  
Record of Minutes

Date: July 28, 2011

Location: Village Hall

**CALL TO ORDER, ROLL CALL, PLEDGE**

Chairman Bortel called the meeting to order at 7:05 p.m. Roll call was taken; Commissioners Bright, Olsen, Derrick, Feagans, Witt, Hendricksen, and Chairman Bortel were present. Commissioner Allen and Buchanan were absent.

Also present were Michael S. Garrigan, Village Planner and Merrilee Trotz, Recording Secretary.

Chairman Bortel led the pledge to the flag.

**APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

Commissioner Derrick made a motion to approve the Agenda. Motion seconded by Commissioner Olsen. Voice vote: All in favor. Opposed – no response. Motion carried 7-0.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES:**

Commissioner Derrick made motion to approve the minutes as presented. Commissioner Hendricksen seconded the motion. Vote: All in favor. Opposed – no response. Motion carried 7-0.

**CHAIR'S COMMENTS:**

Chairman Bortel stated he has re-worked the nomination to address some of the concerns addressed at the Committee of the Whole meeting on July 25<sup>th</sup>.

**COMMISSIONERS COMMENTS:**

Commissioner Bright asked for clarification of Mr. Lambert's concerns from the Committee of the Whole meeting.

Commissioner Derrick indicated she spoke with IHPA today as to whether our CLG status would be in peril. Mr. Ward, a staff member with IHPA, indicated our CLG status would not be in peril as long as we are following our own ordinances. Chairman Bortel had previously forwarded our complete submittal that the Village Board received to IHPA for their review. In May we met with members from IHPA. IHPA agreed the boundaries could be whatever we wanted to make them; if the Village Board approves the District then IHPA might add an

overlay adding a building or two to the edges of our District that would be allowed to take part of the tax credit program but would not the review process to those additional parcels. IHPA indicated if they did an overlay they would consider including the Fazio building, remove the Plainfield National Bank Building, and add the Methodist Church and the Library.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:** (Items not on the Agenda)

No one approached the microphone.

**STAFF REPORT**

Mr. Garrigan indicated there have been no permits submitted for demolition; there are no changes to the watch list; and there have been no pre-application meetings for landmarks; the only development is relating to the Downtown District.

**NEW BUSINESS:**

**Case No. 1544-053111.HPC 24011 W COMMERCIAL STREET**

Commissioner Bright made a motion to open the public hearing. Seconded by Commissioner Olsen.

Vote by roll call: Commissioner Derrick, yes; Commissioner Feagans, yes; Commissioner Witt, yes; Commissioner Hendricksen, yes; Commissioner Olsen, yes; Commissioner Bright, yes; Chairman Bortel, yes. Motion carried 7-0.

Mr. Garrigan indicated this is a public hearing being heard pursuant to public notice in accordance with state statute and all applicable village ordinances. Mr. Garrigan indicated the applicant is seeking a height determination for an accessory structure for a property located on Commercial Street just due west of Route 59 across from the Pioneer house. The applicant is requesting to construct a two story accessory structure or coach house with the height proposed at 22' 6" to be located along the southeast corner of the property. The house is a Side Hall Plan with an approximate construction date estimated between 1875 to 1880 and has been identified as a contributing property individually and also within any possible historic district.

Mr. Garrigan indicated the architect has incorporated a gable roof similar to the design of the main structure. They propose a garage door and a number of windows throughout the second floor, a separate access point; the structure will be used for storage and a potential office. Our zoning ordinance does not allow a residential use in accessory structures. All required setbacks have been complied with. The applicant is requesting your analysis and review of the proposed height of the structure and whether it is consistent with the existing single family home and the surrounding character. Staff believes the proposed elevations are generally consistent as it relates to the general design, the massing, and the existing gable roof. Staff is looking for the input and analysis of this commission.

Commissioner Hendricksen asked if the structure shown on the survey form had been removed. The answer was that it has already been removed. Commissioner Hendricksen suggested adding matching shutters to the front of the coach house and suggested using an architectural garage door that would be in keeping with the period of the neighborhood.

Mr. Panici indicated the shutters were going to be incorporated to match the existing shutters.

Commissioner Olsen asked if the garage was the same height of the house. Mr. Panici indicated the garage would be lower. Mr. Garrigan stated it was generally consistent with the character of the area. Commissioner Hendricksen felt the house was over 30' high.

Commissioner Derrick stated she is looking to see if there were a district if this structure would detract and is it throwing off the ratio of contributing to non-contributing resources in a potential historic district. Commissioner Derrick said she would want garage to be shorter than the house.

Commissioner Olsen suggested it looks tall and thin, asked if the windows were consistent with the house; and stated the garage door seems small.

Commissioner Hendricksen suggested using an eight (8) foot garage door. Commissioner Olsen agreed that would be better; asked about the material to be used; also asked about the shed. Mr. Panici indicated the vinyl siding would match the existing. Mr. Garrigan did not recall seeing or reviewing a shed but would be willing to work with the applicant with this accessory structure.

Commissioner Olsen suggested the returns on the gable could look more Greek Revival.

Commissioner Witt made a motion to close the public hearing. Seconded by Commissioner Feagans.

Vote by roll call: Commissioner Hendricksen, yes; Commissioner Olsen, yes; Commissioner Derrick, yes; Commissioner Feagans, yes; Commissioner Bright, yes; Commissioner Witt, yes; Chairman Bortel, yes. Motion carried 7-0.

Commissioner Derrick made a motion to make a favorable recommendation of the proposed height of the accessory structure located at 24011 W. Commercial Street to the Village Board with stipulations for Greek Revival returns; eight (8) foot garage door and assurance that this structure is shorter than the house. Seconded by Commissioner Hendricksen.

Vote by roll call: Commissioner Feagans, yes; Commissioner Witt, yes; Commissioner Bright, yes; Commissioner Olsen, yes; Commissioner Hendricksen, yes; Commissioner Derrick, yes; Chairman Bortel, yes. Motion carried 7-0.

**Case No.: 1551-070611.COA      15009 S. BARTLETT AVENUE**

Mr. Garrigan summarized the staff report. Mr. Garrigan stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to remove the existing asbestos siding and replace it with fiber cement board. Section 9-149(2) of the Zoning Ordinance provides that a COA is required prior to the issuance of a permit for minor and major work involving any new or other construction, alteration, repair, demolition, relocation, or other material changes that affect the exterior architectural appearance of the structure or site that is either designated individually or is within a historic district. This property is located on Bartlett Avenue within the East Side Historic District; and is identified as a contributing structure by the Village's urban survey; is an

excellent example of a T-Plan house that retains a high degree of integrity; and this property is noted as contributing and potentially an individual landmark candidate.

The existing asbestos siding is not original to the subject property and the Secretary of Interior standards state "The historic character of a property shall be retained and reserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and space that characterize a property shall be avoided." The existing siding on the structure is not original and staff believes that the replacement of this material with fiber cement clapboard would be more consistent with the style of the original siding versus the current asbestos siding. The clapboard design of this new siding will be consistent in design with the original wood siding of this structure.

Staff strongly supports the removal of the asbestos siding on this structure as an improvement to this historical district as being consistent with the character of the district.

Chairman Bortel swore in Christina Woodall.

Commissioner Bright asked if the applicant would ever want to landmark the house; wanted to make sure the correct siding was placed on the house if she did want to landmark her house. Ms. Woodall stated exposing the original clapboard is not an option as one of her children has tested positive for lead poisoning and the clapboard at the back of the house was one of the locations of the lead paint; also she was unable financially to afford the proper abatement of the lead paint.

Commissioner Hendricksen encouraged removal of all the siding. Ms. Woodall stated her contractor indicated it would be covered by tyvek which will encapsulate the lead. Commissioner Hendricksen indicated his concern was not the safety or encapsulation of the lead but is concerned with the reveal of the doors and windows. Ms. Woodall said with the removal of the asbestos the hardy board will actually be the same depth as what they have now. Commissioner Olsen was also concerned with the reveal. Commissioner Hendricksen suggested jamb extension to bring the casings out so they would have the appearance and depth of the original structure.

Commissioner Feagans stated staff recommended approval and he felt approval should be given without limitation; we can give her our insight and input. Commissioner Witt stated once you have a positive lead test in your child you have a lot of other issues you have to fix to comply with state and or federal standards. Commissioner Feagans felt the health of the children was more important than the aesthetics look over the next few years.

Commissioner Derrick stated we can add stipulations to staff's recommendation; asked if the clapboard was under the asbestos on all four elevations; concerned with the face of the casing and the reveal.

Ms. Woodall stated the siding would have a five inch reveal. Ms. Woodall indicated they will not be residing the detached garage but there is no clapboard on the garage.

---

Commissioner Olsen asked if the entire house would be covered with the hardy board. Ms. Woodall said yes. Discussion was held regarding the reveal. Ms. Woodall presented a sample of the hardy board what would be used. It was determined this hardy board was 3/8 inch thick so removal of the asbestos and replacement with this hardy board would be close to the same thickness leaving the reveal very similar to what is there currently.

Commissioner Derrick stated that if the applicant could not restore the original clapboard due to the health issues with the applicant's child, then keeping the original clapboard under the new material would at least preserve the original clapboard for a later restoration.

Commissioner Hendricksen made a motion to recommend approval of the requested Certificate of Appropriateness for fiber cement siding at 15009 S. Bartlett Avenue. Seconded by Commissioner Feagans.

Discussion was held with regard to the reveal, the preservation of the clapboard if existing, the abatement of the asbestos siding, the lead issues and the health of the children; it was determined that no conditions or restrictions should be added.

Vote by roll call: Commissioner Bright, yes; Commissioner Olsen, yes; Commissioner Derrick, yes; Commissioner Witt, yes; Commissioner Feagans, yes; Commissioner Hendricksen, yes; Chairman Bortel, yes. Motion carried 7-0.

**OLD BUSINESS:**

None

**COMMITTEE REPORTS:**

Commissioner Hendricksen stated they have three pamphlets, one for the downtown, one for the downtown, one for Electric Park and one was on Lincoln Highway. They are working on the walking tours.

**DISCUSSION:**

**ADJOURN:**

Commissioner Derrick made a motion to adjourn. Commissioner Olsen seconded the motion. Voice vote: All in favor. 0 - opposed. Motion carried.

Meeting adjourned at 8:15 p. m.

---

Respectfully submitted,  
*Merrilee Trotz* - Recording Secretary