



**Village of Plainfield  
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION (HPC)  
Record of Minutes**

**DATE: September 24, 2009**

**LOCATION: Village Hall**

Chairman Lambert called the meeting to order at 7:05 p.m.

**ROLL CALL**

**Present:** Commissioners Allen, Bright, Olsen, Bortel, Hendricksen, Derrick, Chairman Lambert  
**Absent:** Commissioners Wright and Spangler  
**Also present:** Sara Javoronok-Planner I and Merrilee Trotz - Secretary

**PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

**APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

Chairman Lambert removed the Five Minute Field from the agenda.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES:**

Commissioner Bortel made a motion to approve the minutes for September 10, 2009 as presented. Commissioner Olsen seconded the motion. Voice vote. All Commissioners were in favor. Motion carried.

**CHAIRMAN'S COMMENTS:**

Chairman Lambert stated he appreciated Vice Chairman stepping in for him last meeting.

**FIVE MINUTE FIELDGUIDE:**

Removed from agenda

**COMMISSIONERS COMMENTS:**

None

**PUBLIC COMMENT:** (Items not on the Agenda)

No one approached the microphone.

**STAFF REPORT**

Planner Javoronok stated that staff has not received any not landmark or district applications; staff has had one pre-application meeting with the property owner of 23921 W. Lockport Street; staff has received two demolition applications, one for 24004 W. Lockport Street (currently commercial use) and the second is for 15028 S. Illinois Street (currently residential property seeking commercial rezoning); there have not been any approved demolition permits; no changes to the preservation watch list; and no new developments to report.

Chairman Lambert asked if there was a scheduled visit to the Illinois Street property. Planner Javoronok indicated there has not and that the applicant had gone to the Plan Commission as part of a concept plan and rezoning application. Planner Javoronok indicated the application is looking for more feedback and is going to the next Committee of the Whole Workshop to get more feedback. The rezoning would be from R-1 to B-5. The Comprehensive Plan notes this property to be BT. Planner Javoronok indicated depending on the feedback it would then go to the HPC for a site visit and also a public hearing for the demolition of the house.

**OLD BUSINESS:**

**15311 S. Corbin Street Case No. 1480-082009.HPC**

Planner Javoronok stated this case is a height determination case. The owners are seeking to demolish the existing garage on the site and at a later date they plan to remodel or demolish the existing residence and put a larger residence in its place. This property is located in the R-1 Overlay district and this encompasses most of the village core. The proposed garage is larger than the existing residential structure and as such even with HPC approval a building permit cannot be issued. Staff has discussed this with the applicant and they are applying for a variance which would be reviewed by the Zoning Board of Appeals.

Planner Javoronok stated this is coming before the commission given that the Zoning Ordinance identifies that accessory structures in residential areas that are limited to 15 feet in height except for this part of the core (the R-1 Overlay) and structures in this area are determined on a case by case basis by the HPC and then approved by the Village Board. The legal notice was published and the sign was posted as required.

Planner Javoronok defined the accessory structure. This property is located on the northeast side of Corbin Street, is approximately 60 feet wide and ranges from 280-350 feet deep containing approximately 20,000 square feet. The existing house was built in 1956 and is 1,224 square feet. The Urbanized Core survey notes the residence is a contributing property and the garage is non-contributing.

The proposed garage is a carriage house style garage approximately 1,550 square feet in area and 18.5 feet in height as defined by the village's zoning ordinance. The Village does not limit the size of accessory structures; rather the maximum size is determined by the size of the principal structure so in this case it would be the 12000 square foot house and the maximum percentage of lot coverage and impervious surface coverage. Given the large size of the parcel, the proposed garage does not exceed the maximum lot coverage and impervious surface coverage.

Planner Javoronok indicated staff has concerns with the construction of the garage prior to the remodeling or construction of the existing residence, particularly given the size of the garage. The applicants indicate that this is their plan, but they have not provided drawings, plans, or a timeline of when they plan to do this to the residence.

Planner Javoronok stated staff believes that the height of the proposed carriage house style garage is appropriate and comparable to existing garages that are similar in style but that staff has concern with the construction of a structure that is larger than the principal structure without specific drawings, plans, or a timeline as to the remodeling or construction of a larger principal structure. Further stating that even with HPC approval, the applicant will not be issued a building permit unless a variance is granted by the Zoning Board of Appeals.

Planner Javoronok stated that subject to discussion by the Historic Preservation Commission, staff recommends approval of the height determination for the proposed carriage house style garage.

Chairman Lambert opened the public hearing and sworn in the applicant Robert Smith, who lives at 15311 S. Corbin Street.

Mr. Smith stated they basically want to demolish the old garage down and replace it with a more modern structure of the era we are in now. Mr. Smith indicated they thought about building the house first and it would be more convenient to have a good shop where they could do a lot of the work themselves for the primary structure.

Commissioner Bright asked about the height of the house and of the carriage house.

Mr. Smith said they would be similar indicating they have some rough drawings but have not made up their mind.

Commissioner Olsen asked about the renovation of the existing house.

Mr. Smith indicated they are not positive but with the lot that being 60 foot wide and the need of a driveway we may go forward or backward would be a possibility but the width would not change much. Mr. Smith agreed it would probably be a 2 story and that the house would be similar to the proposed carriage house.

Commissioner Hendricksen stated his concern is more of a time line thing; it would be nice if you had an idea of what the residence structure was going to look like. Commissioner Hendricksen indicated he thought the proposed building was attractive but would like to see a time line and a peek at the drawings of the residence. Commissioner Hendricksen said he would hate to have you build this building and then find out that you are going to get locked up with the residence because now you have set a precedent on the property as far as appearance, size wise and scale. Commissioner Hendricksen stated it would be more better if the applicant has a more complete package would make things easier for the commission's decision.

Mr. Smith agreed and stated they have been preoccupied to get the garage variance and the house has been tossed to the side for the present.

Commissioner Hendricksen said he has had a variance before, understands what has to be done and would hate to see approval for the garage, construct it and then find that you have to get a residence that is going to be appropriate with the garage. Commissioner Hendricksen said a more complete drawing on the residence and a time line.

Commissioner Bright agreed that she liked the drawing but that the drawing was so different from the original house that she would like to see what the applicant had in mind.

Commissioner Olsen asked Planner Javoronok if the applicant builds this big garage and has this little house and then says there is no money to fix the house, decides to tear the house down and turn the garage into a house.

Chairman Lambert stated they have to focus on the information given at this time, that the applicant is trying to build a garage with the intent to build a house and we need to decide if we have the information to make the decision. Chairman Lambert reminded the commissioners that the decision before them is a height determination as remanded by the Zoning Ordinance. Chairman Lambert stated the other issues in the report are zoning issues. Chairman Lambert asked if there was any more testimony or questions.

Mr. Smith indicated he would see if they can get some rough plans for the house that would match the garage.

Chairman Lambert asked for further comments. No one approached the microphone and there was no further testimony contrary to the petitioners.

Commissioner Hendricksen made a motion to close the public hearing. Seconded by Commissioner Bortel. Vote call – motion carried.

Chairman Lambert stated there were two points he wanted to raise for clarification – the first being the letter from the petitioner indicating that the property lies within an historic district – the reason is not because it lies within an historic district as there is no historic district designation in that area – it is coming to us because of the Zoning Ordinance requirement of height determination for garage in R-1 Overlay comes before the Historic Preservation Commission. This is just a clarification so no one thinks a Historic District came in overnight in that neighborhood that no one was informed about. Chairman Lambert asked secondly if the Markley case was heard under the current Zoning Ordinance.

Planner Javoronok said the Markley case was heard in 2007 under the current Zoning Ordinance.

Chairman Lambert stated then the Markley was limited not only in height but also in area that was permitted.

Planner Javoronok agreed.

Chairman Lambert said the Zoning Ordinance identifies that the height of accessory structures in the R-1 Overlay district are determined on a case-by-case basis by the Historic Preservation Commission and approved by the Village Board.

Commissioner Hendricksen said he did not know Mr. Smith but that he has seen his work and felt he was pretty conscious and their plans would be a plus for the village.

Chairman Lambert stated his concern is the zoning issues, that he would rather have the Zoning Board make their determination prior to the HPC recommendation on the height issue. Chairman Lambert stated he did not have a problem with the concept of what the applicant plans to do but feels in the village procedurally this commission is seeing this prematurely.

Planner Javoronok stated it was scheduled for the height determination prior to the applicant filing a variance application.

Commissioner Olsen asked if both approvals were needed.

Planner Javoronok replied yes and the applicant is scheduled for the ZBA October 6<sup>th</sup> and the next HPC meeting would be October 8<sup>th</sup>.

Chairman Lambert stated he would prefer hearing what the ZBA had to say before this commission states they are fine with the height, then the ZBA might not like the height, mass, size or want a time frame on the house.

Commissioner Olsen said if the application had gone to the ZBA first and got the issues ironed out, then this commission would just hear the height issue.

Commissioner Hendricksen indicated it was out of order also.

Chairman Lambert asked if this was not a hardship for the applicant this commission would prefer to hear it after ZBA.

Commissioner Hendricksen made a motion to reconsider this application at the October 8<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Plainfield Historic Commission. Commissioner Bortel seconded the motion. Roll call.

Aye: Commissioners Bortel, Bright, Derrick, Hendricksen, Olsen, Allen, Chairman Lambert,

Nay: None

Motion carried.

Chairman Lambert turned the meeting over to Vice Chairman Bortel and Commissioner Olsen and Chairman Lambert reclude themselves at 7:35 p.m.

#### **NEW BUSINESS:**

##### **14931 S. BARTLETT AVE. Case No. 1486-090909.HPC**

Planner Javoronok stated the applicant is the owner of said property and is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for an extension of the existing 4 foot wood white picket fence in the rear and side yards. This property is located approximately mid-block on Bartlett Avenue between Amboy and Lockport Streets within the East Side Historic District and is also designated as a local landmark. The ordinance specifies that landmarked properties are presumed to have architecture or historically significant features. The historic core survey from 2006 indicates that this property is a textbook example of the Queen Anne style and is outstanding in terms of details and integrity. The proposed fence is in accordance with the General Design Guidelines and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The applicant is installing a new gate and arbor. Subject to discussion staff recommends approval of the proposed fence.

Commissioner Hendricksen stated the existing fence looks like a very traditional style fence, further stating it fits in nicely. Commissioner Hendricksen asked if they were going to duplicate the pattern and retain the original portion.

Planner Javoronok stated yes.

Commissioner Derrick asked the location of the fence.

Planner Javoronok explained where the fence would be placed.

Commissioner Derrick made a motion to approve the requested Certificate of Appropriateness for a rear yard fence at 14931 S. Bartlett Avenue. Commissioner Bright seconded the motion.

Aye: Commissioners Bright, Derrick, Hendricksen, Allen, Bortel  
Nay: None  
Motion carried.

Chairman Lambert returned to the meeting.

**COMMITTEE REPORTS:**

Commissioner Bortel stated there will be a special meeting next Wednesday, September 30<sup>th</sup> at 4:00 p.m. to work on the CLG application for the brochure technology idea for the downtown walking tour. Also the LDDC meeting for October 1<sup>st</sup> has been cancelled.

Commissioner Bright wanted to let everyone know that the VPA was going to have a block party picnic on October 10<sup>th</sup> on Ottawa Street between James and Fox River.

Commissioner Derrick stated Public Outreach has been working on the brochure for the walking tour and picked a date for October 24<sup>th</sup>.

**DISCUSSION:**

Commissioner Bortel stated the Plainfield Historical Society is having an Open House, reopening of the MainStreet museum on Sunday, October 2<sup>nd</sup> at 1:00 p.m. to 4:00 p.m. Also the water tank at the depot is being primed and painted by Commissioner Hendricksen and Commissioner Bortel next week.

**ADJOURN:**

Commissioner Bortel made a motion to adjourn. Commissioner Bright seconded the motion. Voice vote. All the Commissioners were in favor.

Meeting adjourned at 7:45 p.m.

---

Respectfully submitted,  
*Merrilee Trotz* - Recording Secretary