



Village of Plainfield
Historic Preservation Commission
Record of Minutes

Date: November 12, 2009

Location: Village Hall

Chairman Lambert called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

ROLL CALL

Present: Commissioners Spangler, Allen, Bright, Olsen, Wright, Derrick, Chairman Lambert
Absent: Commissioner Bortel
Also present: Michael Garrigan –Village Planner and Merrilee Trotz - Secretary

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

Commissioner Derrick indicated a correction of the word brochure instead of application in the second sentence under Committee Reports. Commissioner Allen indicated her name had been omitted from roll call. Commissioner Bright made a motion to approve the minutes for October 22, 2009 as amended. Commissioner Olsen seconded the motion. Voice vote. All Commissioners were in favor. Motion carried.

CHAIRMAN'S COMMENTS:

None

FIVE MINUTE FIELDGUIDE:

Chairman Lambert presented a five minute field guide on what makes something historic. Buildings may be historically important because they are associated with significant people who shaped our community; because they are associated with significant architect who contributed to the cultural development of our community; because they are associated with a significant architectural pattern or style in our community; because they are associated with a particular or interesting use of construction methods or materials in our community; because they are associated with a representative architectural style or collection of similar buildings in our community; or because they are associated with a significant pattern of development that shaped the evolution of our community. He also explained the purpose of historic preservation to acknowledge and recognize significant buildings and sites.

COMMISSIONERS COMMENTS:

Commissioner Spangler expressed concerns about comments in the newspaper regarding the Fazio building. Several commissioners are concerned that this committee is viewed in a negative light in regarding to public opinion and the Board itself.

Commissioner Wright stated there were two anniversaries to be noted. The first being November 3, 2008 is when the Village Board approved the East Side Historic District. This district has been on the books for one year and the committee has helped with several certificates of appropriateness. The second anniversary is November 12, 2008 when there was a staff meeting with several staff members and two or more preservation commissioners wherein there was a discussion regarding code enforcement and demolition by neglect. The hope was they would move forward and have an approach for the Village on how to approach Historic Preservation and code enforcement so we did not encourage demolition but did encourage maintenance of properties. He asked if this could be placed on the ongoing agenda as old business. He would like to move forward with this and have something that will benefit the entire community. Commissioner Olsen would also like dialog with code enforcement and has asked many times. Chairman Lambert expressed his concerns about how it is repeatedly noted that HPC has hindered projects. Several commissioners also expressed their frustrations.

PUBLIC COMMENT: (Items not on the Agenda)

No one approached the microphone.

STAFF REPORT

Planner Garrigan stated there were no new Landmark or District applications since the last commission meeting; there have been no pre-application meetings; no demolition applications have been received or approved. Planner Garrigan indicated the Go-Tane gas station was demolished yesterday. Planner Garrigan said the preservation watch list remains the same. He indicated, regarding the structure at 24404 W. Lockport, the Village Board did not support preservation of this structure; there was a lack of support for the architectural study; and there was general support to the concept plan. He indicated this case will return to the Plan Commission for site plan review in the future.

Commissioner Wright stated there is a new concrete pad near what was the former hatch plat home and stated if they are doing an interpretive sign for that foundation, the commission would be willing to provide additional information if the Forest Preserve needs it.

Chairman Lambert asked why the house immediately to the south was not demolished at the same time as the gas station as both had been approved. Commissioner Spangler wondered if it had anything to do with the IDOT construction.

Chairman Lambert and the other commissioner stated they were very sorry to learn that Sara Javoronok was a casualty of the recent cut backs. Chairman Lambert also stated we obtained certified local government status and Preservation America recognition largely due to her persistence. All the commissioners thanked Sara for her time and dedication to the commission and wished her the very best in future endeavors. Planner Garrigan recognized the hard work Sara did for the commission and the Village. He stated this was a sad day for the Village.

NEW BUSINESS:

Commissioner Olsen made a motion to open the public hearing. Seconded by Commissioner Derrick. Vote by roll call:
Aye: Commissioners Allen, Bright, Olsen, Wright, Derrick, Spangler, Chairman Lambert
Nay: None
Motion carried.

1490-100109.HPC (Public Hearing) 23921 W. Lockport Street

Planner Garrigan stated this is a public hearing pursuant to village ordinance as it related to notice requirements. The applicant Betty Gaylord is requesting landmark designation for 23921 Lockport Street located on Lockport Street just east of Route 59 in the Village's Historical Downtown Core. Elizabeth Darr purchased this property in 1894. There is a significant long heritage of prominent individuals who have owned this property. Staff outlined the period of significance. There are many Queen Anne style properties in the village however this property retains its original detailing and elements and has had minimal alterations. This property was included in the 2006 Plainfield Historic Urbanized Core survey wherein it was recommended for individual local landmark status. The commission has to evaluate the property's eligibility for landmark designation by meeting certain criteria. Staff recommends nominating the Darr-Gaylord House for designation under the following criteria:

- (c) *Is identified with a person or persons who significantly contributed to the development of the community, county, state or nation;*

The residence is identified with David Darr, who was a member of an early pioneer family in Plainfield. Staff notes that David's wife purchased the property in 1896 and that the 1898 fire insurance map states that it was under construction. David Darr died in 1897.

- (d) *Embodies distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style valuable for the study of a period, type, method of construction or use of indigenous materials;*
- (e) *Embodies elements of design, detailing, materials or craftsmanship that are of architectural significance;*

The residence remains an excellent example of the Queen Anne style and has a high degree of integrity.

- (j) *Is suitable of preservation or restoration.*

The residence is largely intact. Minor modifications have occurred over time, but remains largely as originally constructed. The *Urbanized Core Survey* recommended it for individual landmark status.

Chairman Lambert stated there was no public related to this property present to make additional comments and no objectors were present.

Commissioner Derrick asked about the period of significance cutoff date of 2003. Chairman Lambert stated the commission can discuss this.

Commissioner Bright made a motion to close the public hearing. Seconded by Commissioner Wright.

Aye: Commissioners Spangler, Allen, Bright, Olsen, Wright, Derrick, Chairman Lambert

Nay: None

Motion carried.

Planner Garrigan stated based on staff's analysis staff recommends approval of the landmark application for 23921 W. Lockport Street.

Chairman Lambert stated the practice in the past for Landmark nominations has been 30 or 50 year cutoff following the standards for the National Register of historic places or some other national guidelines. He stated we have the ability to accept other dates.

Commissioner Derrick stated she was use to the 50 year. Discussion was held regarding the ending period of significance. Commissioner Spangler asked if it was known when the last modifications were made to the house. Chairman Lambert stated probably the early twentieth century with the rear porch to the west. Chairman Lambert said if you want to recognize Betty Gaylord's 76 year residency in the property you may say we are going to take the period from 1897 to 2009. Commissioner Derrick did not support 2003. Commissioner Olsen asked what difference it would make. Chairman Lambert said the criterion for a certificate of appropriateness is to judge it based on the period of significance. All commissioners supported bringing the period of significance to 2009.

Commissioner Olsen asked if there were ever any outbuildings. Chairman Lambert said when this was a single lot there were 3 buildings on this site; where the present house sits on the corner of Dillman and the public alley was the site of a 2 story barn; the house sat back in the center of this lot between Betty's house and the house to the south; there was another small square building on the property. It appears that once this house was built that the main house to the west was torn down and then the barn was torn down and the small one story square building was added onto to make the present building at the southwest corner of this original parcel. Chairman Lambert asked that an inclusion be made of the 1898 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map not only because it gives context but is also referenced in the landmark nomination as proving the date of construction. Chairman Lambert said the subsequent Sanborn maps from 1931 and 1944 should be added to show there what alterations have been made.

Chairman Lambert asked that the apostrophe in 1940's in the last sentence in the paragraph above The Family House be removed to read as follows "In the late 1940s the Jones' Hardware store expanded and occupied the entire building that had been erected by its founders I 1892."

Commissioner Wright asked if there were any other photos turned in with the application. Chairman Lambert indicated Betty was not able to access any.

Commissioner Derrick said the language about the shutters having been removed was confusing stating that we believe the shutters were original but just installed differently on the building. Chairman Lambert said we could add nonetheless a significant number of the original shutters have been remounted outside the windows. Commissioner Derrick suggested that a number of the shutters have been removed from original hinges and affixed to the building. Chairman Lambert suggested adding a line stating nonetheless the remaining shutters appear to be original to the residence. Commissioners agreed.

Commissioner Derrick asked about adding there may be missing shutters on the north facade at the meeting mullion.. Chairman Lambert said on four lines up from the bottom of the first paragraph on page three before "The windows at the second floor are slightly shorter ..." we could add a sentence that the shutters at the meeting mullion have been removed where historically they would not have opened flat against the exterior wall plane

Commissioner Derrick asked if they wanted to add the brackets have finials to the paragraph discussing the porch brackets on page 4 third paragraph. She said they are described as turned, spindle brackets. Chairman Lambert stated turned, spindle brackets with dropped pendants and agreed the need to get the details correct as that is the purpose to make it easy if anyone wanted to do a national registry it would be completely transferable..

Chairman Lambert summarized the recommended changes as follows: the end date of the period of significance would be 2009 as opposed to 2003; on page 2 the sentence starting "Turned, spindle brackets project from the support ..." add with dropped pendants between brackets and project ; on page 3 add the following sentence: The shutters at the meeting mullion have been removed where, historically, they would have not opened flat against the exterior wall plane. after "The windows at the second floor are slightly shorter than the windows at the first floor." Remove the apostrophe from 1940's to read 1940s; and under statement of significance the date would be altered to 2009 instead of 2003.

Commissioner Spangler made a motion to recommend approval of the landmark application for 23921 W. Lockport Street as amended. Seconded by Commissioner Olsen.

Aye: Commissioners Spangler, Allen, Bright, Olsen, Chairman Lambert, Commissioners Wright, Derrick
Nay: None
Motion carried.

Chairman Lambert said this would go to the Village Board in December for their consideration.

Commissioner Olsen complimented the thoroughness of the petition as being well documented.

OLD BUSINESS:

Downtown Historic District

Planner Garrigan updated the commission with a discussion between the Chairman, Mayor and Village Administrator of the current status of the Downtown Historic District. There was a general discussion of having this go to a future COW meeting. Chairman Lambert clarified his position in the meeting. Commissioner Spangler asked if it was possible to do a thematic district downtown and if by modifying the current application or pulling it and doing it over if this would delay this for a year. Planner Garrigan indicated he would defer to Jim Harvey for his opinion on possibly modifying the existing application or preparing a thematic application. After much discussion the majority of the Commissioners agreed take the Downtown Historic District to the Village Board for a vote.

East Sign Historic District Signage

Planner Garrigan wanted to follow up on the signage for the East Side Historic District. Commissioner Spangler indicated there was a sketch submitted and Chairman Lambert indicated there were 2 sign proposals that would attach to the street signs. One could be produced by the Street Department and one was a cast sign or silk screen. No pricing proposals had been received. Commissioner Olsen said there were sketches that were approved and they wanted to move forward with those concepts. Planner Garrigan said he would work with Public Works and try to get this back on the next meeting. Chairman Lambert explained the reasoning behind the street sign option.

Acknowledgment of Sara Javoronok's Contribution to Preservation to Plainfield

Chairman Lambert asked if they can meet as a commission for a social function to honor and thank Sara Javoronok. If that is not possible then they would like present her with a recognition plaque. Planner Garrigan indicated he would look into this.

COMMITTEE REPORTS:

None

DISCUSSION:

None

ADJOURN:

Commissioner Derrick made a motion to adjourn. Commissioner Bright seconded the motion. Voice vote. All the Commissioners were in favor.

Meeting adjourned at 8:50 p. m.

Respectfully submitted,
Merrilee Trotz - Recording Secretary